

Talking Points

The TCFD Recommendations and Their Implications for the Financial Sector



Lauren Smart, Managing Director, Global Head Financial Institutions Business, Trucost, part of S&P Dow Jones Indices

The recommendations of the Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosures (TCFD) look set to drive an increase in reporting of quantified, forward-looking ESG data and analysis. Trucost considers some of the main implications for the financial sector.

1. What is the TCFD and what are its recommendations?

The TCFD was formed by the Financial Stability Board, the international body that seeks to strengthen and protect markets from systemic threats such as climate change through its membership of national financial authorities. The TCFD recommendations provide guidance to all market participants on the disclosure of information on the financial implications of environmental risks and opportunities in annual reports and accounts to enable its integration into investment and business decisions (see Exhibit 1).¹

The TCFD structured its recommendations around four core elements of the way in which organizations operate: governance, strategy, risk management, and metrics and targets (see Exhibit 2). The guidance applies to organizations in all sectors, with supplemental guidance for the financial sector including banks, insurance, asset managers and asset owners, and non-financial but potentially high-impact sectors including energy, transportation, materials and buildings, and agriculture, food and forestry.

Exhibit 1: The TCFD Recommendations

KEY FEATURES OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Adoptable by all organizations

Included in financial filings

Designed to solicit decision-useful, forward-looking information on financial impacts

Strong focus on risks and opportunities related to transition to lower-carbon economy

Source: Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosure, 2017. Table is provided for illustrative purposes.

¹TCFD Final Report, *Recommendations of the Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosure*, 2017, available at <https://www.fsb-tcfd.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/FINAL-TCFD-Report-062817.pdf>

Exhibit 2: Core Elements of Recommended Climate-Related Financial Disclosures



Governance

The organization's governance around climate-related risks and opportunities.

Strategy

The actual and potential impacts of climate-related risks and opportunities on the organization's businesses, strategy, and financial planning.

Risk Management

The process used by the organization to identify, assess, and manage climate-related risks.

Metrics

The metrics and targets used to assess and manage relevant climate-related risks and opportunities.

Source: Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosure, 2017. Chart is provided for illustrative purposes.

One common misconception is that the TCFD recommendations are only concerned with carbon emissions. In fact, the recommendations clearly state that the financial performance of organizations may also be affected by other climate-related environmental issues, in particular water scarcity and water quality, and disclosure on these issues is included in the recommendations.

2. Why should organizations report in accordance with the TCFD recommendations?

Risk management is the main reason. Companies face a host of physical, regulatory and marketplace risks from climate-related environmental impacts which could affect their financial performance, their ability to repay loans or pay insurance premiums, and therefore potentially affecting their firm value with implications for shareholders, creditors, pension funds, banks, and insurers. It is therefore in the interest of all market participants to disclose data, and require data from their investee companies, on environmental risks. This will enable markets to price risk and support informed investment decisions.

Another important reason organizations should disclose under the TCFD recommendations is the potential business opportunities of the transition to a low-carbon economy. It is estimated that some USD 1 trillion per year of investments in low-carbon technology will be needed for the foreseeable future if we are to meet the Paris Agreement goals.² Companies creating products and services that enable this transition may be among the winners, while companies that persist with carbon-intensive activities could be among the losers. Financial institutions will want to ensure they can identify and profit from the winners.

3. What metrics should the financial sector disclose?

The TCFD recommendations are clear and comprehensive, but not prescriptive. They recognize that different types of organizations need different ranges of metrics that can be used in different applications. For example, while financial institutions should report their own operational emissions from offices and IT networks, the carbon emissions of their assets and investments are likely to be far more significant.

As a starting point, the main metric that the TCFD recommends asset owners should disclose is the weighted average carbon intensity of their portfolios expressed in metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent (tCO₂e) per million U.S. dollars revenue. The TCFD says asset owners can disclose other useful metrics such as the total carbon emissions of a portfolio normalized by its market value (or assets under management), expressed as tCO₂e/USD million invested. Other options include the carbon efficiency of a portfolio measured as tCO₂e/USD million revenue, or exposure to carbon-related assets as the amount or percentage of the current portfolio value.

The TCFD acknowledges the challenges of current carbon metrics—for instance, that they should not necessarily be interpreted as risk metrics. It views reporting of weighted average carbon intensity of a portfolio as a “first step” and expects that its disclosure will prompt important advancements in the development of decision-useful, climate-related risk metrics.

² International Energy Agency, *World Energy Outlook Special Briefing for COP21*, 2015, available at https://www.iea.org/media/news/WEO_INDC_Paper_Final_WEB.PDF

The TCFD's message for the financial sector is that the evolving nature of carbon footprinting should not be an excuse for doing nothing—they should learn by doing. Nor will the qualitative approach to disclosure of some organizations suffice. The market is demanding quantitative data that is robust, more standardized, and insightful to inform investment analysis and decision making.

4. What is scenario analysis and how should organizations do it?

One of the most important barriers to sustainable finance is the disconnect between the long-term problems posed by climate change, and the comparatively short-term focus on business strategies and performance of companies and financial institutions. Research by the 2° Investing Initiative found that most market participants only forecast financial performance up to five years ahead. In contrast, it could take 20 years or more for the most serious impacts of climate change on economies to develop—although the early signs are already clear and having damaging effects.³ In his groundbreaking speech at Lloyds of London in 2015, Mark Carney, chair of the Financial Stability Board and governor of the Bank of England, called this issue the tragedy of the horizons, “Once climate change becomes a defining issue for financial stability”, he said, “it may already be too late.”⁴

To address this problem, the TCFD recommends that organizations use the well-known technique of scenario analysis within the context of climate change risks. Financial institutions can use scenario analysis to assess the performance of their investments and portfolios under a range of future physical, regulatory and market scenarios. Companies can stress test their business models to see how resilient they are likely to be in the transition to a low-carbon economy over a variety of time periods such as by 2020, 2030, or 2050.

Scenario analysis from a climate change perspective involves comparing an organization's strategy to a number of future climate-related scenarios, including one in which governments implement policies to limit the average global increase in temperature to two degrees Celsius, in accordance with country commitments made under the Paris Agreement.

Trucost calculates that average carbon prices could increase more than sevenfold from current prices to USD 120 per metric ton by 2030 as a result. Under other scenarios, the trajectory of carbon price increases might be different if policies are weak or delayed. To understand their exposure to rising carbon prices and inform scenario analysis, companies and financial institutions may find it useful to use a carbon pricing tool such as the **Carbon Pricing Investor Toolkit** and the **Corporate Carbon Pricing Tool**.

5. How can the financial sector use the insights from these metrics and analysis?

Aside from two-degree scenario analysis, there are a range of metrics and tools available to financial institutions. The choice of tool depends on their investment strategy and whether the information is for reporting purposes or for more forward-looking consideration. For example, if an asset manager wants to assess exposure to fossil fuel-based “stranded assets”, an assessment of the exposure of a fund to fossil fuel reserves and the carbon emissions embedded within them is required. Another example of stranded assets includes energy inefficient real estate, which the owner is unable to rent. For asset owners that wish to disassociate or restrict their investments in coal, an assessment of the holding's coal mining and coal power generation activities is required. For many market participants, understanding a company's mix of “brown activities” and “green activities” is a core piece of information. To understand and communicate the positive green impact of a fund, a deeper assessment of the types of “green” activities is necessary, and ideally a robust quantification of the carbon savings or environmental benefit per USD million invested.

6. What practical steps should the financial sector take right now toward meeting the TCFD recommendations?

The TCFD says widespread adoption of its recommendations is critical. The Financial Stability Board has extended the TCFD's mandate until at least September 2018 so that it can monitor the uptake of the recommendations and evaluate whether disclosures

³ 2° Investing Initiative, *All Swans are Black in the Dark: How the Short-term Focus of Financial Analysis does not Shed Light on Long-term Risks*, 2017, available at <https://www.genfound.org/media/1383/all-swans-are-black-in-the-dark.pdf>

⁴ Mark Carney, *Breaking the Tragedy of the Horizon—Climate Change and Financial Stability*, speech to Lloyds of London, 2015, available at <http://www.bankofengland.co.uk/publications/Pages/speeches/2015/844.aspx>

meet the needs of users. The EU High Level Expert Group on Sustainable Finance recommends that the TCFD recommendations be integrated into EU policy.⁵ More than 100 companies with a combined market cap of around USD 3.5 trillion and financial institutions responsible for assets of about USD 25 trillion have stated their support for the TCFD recommendations following the launch in July 2017.⁶

The TCFD says asset owners have a crucial role to play in influencing better disclosure as they sit at the top of the investment chain. They can engage with companies to encourage disclosure in accordance with the TCFD recommendations. They can also require their asset managers to meet the recommendations. Asset owners can follow the TCFD recommendations themselves to show beneficiaries that they are meeting their fiduciary duty to consider climate-related risks and opportunities in investments decisions. Asset managers can follow the TCFD recommendations to demonstrate to asset owners that they take a responsible approach to investment.

Immediate practical steps that organizations in the financial sector can already take toward meeting the TCFD recommendations include:

- Measure and disclose the carbon footprint of your investments, using the weighted average carbon intensity, alongside other carbon efficiency assessments;
- Consider which other carbon metrics and analytical tools, both retrospective and prospective, may be appropriate for your investment strategy and reporting;
- Focus on each asset class as the risks and opportunities will vary and so will the most appropriate carbon metrics;
- Supplement footprint analysis with deep dives into key carbon-intensive sectors such as energy, transportation, materials, and food, agriculture and forestry;
- Conduct water footprinting to assess risks from sectors exposed to increasing water scarcity and pollution in their operations and supply chains; and
- Demonstrate that your organization is responding to the TCFD recommendations by disclosing progress in annual reports and financial filings.

ABOUT TRUCOST, PART OF S&P DOW JONES INDICES, A DIVISION OF S&P GLOBAL

Trucost is part of S&P Dow Jones Indices. A leader in carbon and environmental data and risk analysis, Trucost assesses risks relating to climate change, natural resource constraints, and broader environmental, social, and governance factors. Companies and financial institutions use Trucost intelligence to understand their ESG exposure to these factors, inform resilience and identify transformative solutions for a more sustainable global economy. S&P Global's commitment to environmental analysis and product innovation allows us to deliver essential ESG investment-related information to the global marketplace. For more information, visit www.trucost.com.

⁵ HLEG Interim Report, *Financing a Sustainable European Economy*, 2017, available at https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/170713-sustainable-finance-report_en.pdf

⁶ TCFD Press Release, 29 June 2017, *Final Recommendations of the Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosures (TCFD) Help Companies Disclose Climate-related Risks and Opportunities Efficiently and Effectively*, available at <https://www.fsb-tcfd.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/Press-Release-Final-TCFD-Recommendations-Report-Release-29-June-2017-FINAL-IMMEDIATE-RELEASE-UPDATED-SUPPORTERS-LINK.pdf>

GENERAL DISCLAIMER

Copyright © 2017 S&P Trucost Limited (“Trucost”), an affiliate of S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. All rights reserved.

This publication and related materials are not intended to provide and do not constitute financial or investment advice. The information in this publication should not be construed or relied upon in making, or refraining from making, any investment decisions with respect to a specific company or security or be used as legal advice. Trucost is not an investment advisor, and Trucost makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any investment fund or other investment vehicle. A decision to invest in any investment fund or other investment vehicle should not be made in reliance on any of the statements set forth in this document.

This publication and related materials (“Information”) have been prepared solely for informational purposes only based upon information generally available to the public from sources believed to be reliable. The Information may not be reproduced or disseminated in whole or in part without the prior written permission of Trucost. The information may not be used to verify or correct other data, create indexes, risk models, or analytics or in connection with issuing, offering, sponsoring, managing, marketing any securities, portfolios, financial products, or other investment vehicles.

Historical data and analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance, analysis, forecast or prediction.

Trucost, its affiliates, or its and their third-party data providers and licensors (collectively “Trucost Parties”) do not guarantee the accuracy or completeness of the Information. Trucost Parties are not responsible for any errors or omissions, regardless of the cause, for the results obtained from the use of the Information. THE TRUCOST PARTIES MAKE NO WARRANTIES OR REPRESENTATIONS, AND, TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY LAW, EACH TRUCOST PARTY HEREBY EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ALL IMPLIED WARRANTIES, INCLUDING WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE. WITHOUT LIMITING ANY OF THE FOREGOING AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY LAW, IN NO EVENT SHALL ANY OF THE TRUCOST PARTIES HAVE ANY LIABILITY REGARDING ANY OF THE INFORMATION FOR DIRECT, INDIRECT, SPECIAL, PUNITIVE, CONSEQUENTIAL (INCLUDING LOST PROFITS) OR AN OTHER DAMAGES EVEN IF NOTIFIED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGES. The foregoing shall not exclude or limit any liability that may not be applicable law be excluded or limited.

‘Trucost’ is the trading name of S&P Trucost Limited a limited company registered in England company number 3929223 whose registered office is at 20 Canada Square, London E14 5HL, UK.

GENERAL DISCLAIMER

Copyright © 2017 by S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC, a part of S&P Global. All rights reserved. Standard & Poor’s®, S&P 500® and S&P® are registered trademarks of Standard & Poor’s Financial Services LLC (“S&P”), a subsidiary of S&P Global. Dow Jones® is a registered trademark of Dow Jones Trademark Holdings LLC (“Dow Jones”). Trademarks have been licensed to S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Redistribution, reproduction and/or photocopying in whole or in part are prohibited without written permission. This document does not constitute an offer of services in jurisdictions where S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC, Dow Jones, S&P or their respective affiliates (collectively “S&P Dow Jones Indices”) do not have the necessary licenses. All information provided by S&P Dow Jones Indices is impersonal and not tailored to the needs of any person, entity or group of persons. S&P Dow Jones Indices receives compensation in connection with licensing its indices to third parties. Past performance of an index is not a guarantee of future results.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Exposure to an asset class represented by an index is available through investable instruments based on that index. S&P Dow Jones Indices does not sponsor, endorse, sell, promote or manage any investment fund or other investment vehicle that is offered by third parties and that seeks to provide an investment return based on the performance of any index. S&P Dow Jones Indices makes no assurance that investment products based on the index will accurately track index performance or provide positive investment returns. S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC is not an investment advisor, and S&P Dow Jones Indices makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any such investment fund or other investment vehicle. A decision to invest in any such investment fund or other investment vehicle should not be made in reliance on any of the statements set forth in this document. Prospective investors are advised to make an investment in any such fund or other vehicle only after carefully considering the risks associated with investing in such funds, as detailed in an offering memorandum or similar document that is prepared by or on behalf of the issuer of the investment fund or other vehicle. Inclusion of a security within an index is not a recommendation by S&P Dow Jones Indices to buy, sell, or hold such security, nor is it considered to be investment advice.

These materials have been prepared solely for informational purposes based upon information generally available to the public and from sources believed to be reliable. No content contained in these materials (including index data, ratings, credit-related analyses and data, research, valuations, model, software or other application or output therefrom) or any part thereof (Content) may be modified, reverse-engineered, reproduced or distributed in any form or by any means, or stored in a database or retrieval system, without the prior written permission of S&P Dow Jones Indices. The Content shall not be used for any unlawful or unauthorized purposes. S&P Dow Jones Indices and its third-party data providers and licensors (collectively “S&P Dow Jones Indices Parties”) do not guarantee the accuracy, completeness, timeliness or availability of the Content. S&P Dow Jones Indices Parties are not responsible for any errors or omissions, regardless of the cause, for the results obtained from the use of the Content. THE CONTENT IS PROVIDED ON AN “AS IS” BASIS. S&P DOW JONES INDICES PARTIES DISCLAIM ANY AND ALL EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, ANY WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE OR USE, FREEDOM FROM BUGS, SOFTWARE ERRORS OR DEFECTS, THAT THE CONTENT’S FUNCTIONING WILL BE UNINTERRUPTED OR THAT THE CONTENT WILL OPERATE WITH ANY SOFTWARE OR HARDWARE CONFIGURATION. In no event shall S&P Dow Jones Indices Parties be liable to any party for any direct, indirect, incidental, exemplary, compensatory, punitive, special or consequential damages, costs, expenses, legal fees, or losses (including, without limitation, lost income or lost profits and opportunity costs) in connection with any use of the Content even if advised of the possibility of such damages.

S&P Dow Jones Indices keeps certain activities of its business units separate from each other in order to preserve the independence and objectivity of their respective activities. As a result, certain business units of S&P Dow Jones Indices may have information that is not available to other business units. S&P Dow Jones Indices has established policies and procedures to maintain the confidentiality of certain non-public information received in connection with each analytical process.

In addition, S&P Dow Jones Indices provides a wide range of services to, or relating to, many organizations, including issuers of securities, investment advisers, broker-dealers, investment banks, other financial institutions and financial intermediaries, and accordingly may receive fees or other economic benefits from those organizations, including organizations whose securities or services they may recommend, rate, include in model portfolios, evaluate or otherwise address.